



TWV/37/4

ORIGINAL: English

DATE: June 4, 2003

INTERNATIONAL UNION FOR THE PROTECTION OF NEW VARIETIES OF PLANTS
GENEVA

**TECHNICAL WORKING PARTY
FOR
VEGETABLES**

**Thirty-Seventh Session
Roelofarendsveen, Netherlands, June 23 to 27, 2003**

WORKING PAPER ON TEST GUIDELINES FOR VEGETABLE KALE

prepared by the Office of the Union

Introduction

1. At its Thirty -eighth Session, held in Geneva from April 15 to 17, 2002, the Technical Committee adopted revised Test Guidelines for Vegetable Kale subject to the amendments and the linguistic changes recommended by the Editorial Committee. The amendments recommended by the Editorial committee are reproduced in second column of the table in the Annex to this document.

2. Mr. Niall Green, leading expert for Vegetable Kale, in his correspondence to the Office of the Union, recommended that the application of Test Guidelines for Vegetable Kale should be limited to Curly Kale only, with the name *Brassica oleracea* L. var. *sabellica* L. or *Brassica oleracea* L. Curly Kale Group as the draft Test Guideline document, as it stands, does not have sufficient characteristics and states of expression to describe the range of Vegetable Kale expression. Annex I contains, in its third column, Mr. Green's comments on the questions raised by the Editorial Committee. Annex II contains Mr. Green's further remarks on this issue.

[Annex I follows]

Changes proposed by the Enlarged Editorial Committee (EEC) in April 2002, which are to be included in the Test Guidelines submitted to the TC (document TG/90/6(proj)) and comments made by the Leading Expert

	Changes proposed by the EEC	Comments by Mr. Green (Leading Experts for Vegetable Kale)
Chap. III, para. 3	The third sentence to start "As a minimum..."	
Chap. V	To ask the leading expert to provide information on different types "Borecole/Curly Kale, Collards, Tree Kale"	As I briefly mentioned in Tokyo, the name has been the main problem with this guideline. Perhaps this should have been discussed by the TWV in Tokyo. I thought that name Vegetable Kale would allow a wider range of material to be tested under this guideline, but the guideline does not have sufficient characters and character states to describe the range of Vegetable Kale expression. I have therefore reached the conclusion that we should limit the guideline to Curly Kale only, with the name <i>Brassica oleracea</i> L. var. <i>sabellica</i> L. or <i>Brassica oleracea</i> L. Curly Kale Group. The consequence of this would be the deletion of characteristic 14, and state 5 for both characteristics and 8. In the Technical Questionnaire, state 5 for 5.4 would also be deleted, as would 7.2. I think this proposal may have to be agreed by the TWV or at least the subgroup members. 7
Chap. VII, ch. 7, 8	To ask the leading expert why "red" and "purple" are combined rather than separate states.	If you think it better to have two separate states of expression, we need to have separate example varieties. If you confirm that it is not possible or practical to separate the state into two states, the Editorial Committee will be satisfied. It would not be possible to separate varieties consistently into red or purple, as environment influences the expression. Colour varies in expression from red to purple and the colour can also change with time from red to purple, which is why 'red or purple' is proposed.
Chap. VII, ch. 14	To receive Notes (1) and (2)	
Chap. VII, ch. 15	To remove "on" from the bracketed phrase.	
Chap. VII, ch. 18	To ask leading expert whether it is possible to introduce a new characteristic "Presence of laminated tissues along midrib: absent – present" If this is not the case, to ask leading expert to provide explanation on "laminated tissues."	The qualification for this characteristic is effectively defining a petiole. The midrib occurs in the leaf blade. The petiole starts at the base of the leaf blade. Where the leaf blade runs to the base of the leaf, there can be no petiole. In its current form, the qualification is confusing and is unnecessary, so I propose we remove it.

[Annex II follows]

Comments on the Nomenclature and Taxonomy used in the Vegetable Kale Guideline (90/5)
(prepared by Mr. Niall Green, Leading Expert for Vegetable Kale)

The aim of the revised draft was to describe:

1. Curly Kale,
2. crosses between Curly Kale and other Kales
3. includes specific varieties (cultivars) of Palm Tree Kale

under the following nomenclature:

VEGETABLE KALE

(Borecole/Curly Kale, Collards, Tree Kale)

Brassica oleracea L. con var. *acephala* (DC.) Alef. var. *sabellica* L., var. *acephala*, DC., var. *palmifolia* DC.

PROBLEMS IN USING THE IS NOMENCLATURE

- In retrospect, the wish to include a wide range of Kales was agreed with little thought to the consequences. The main reason was to accommodate a wide range of Kale varieties such as 'Nerodi Toscana' within the Curly Kale guideline. However, in its present form, the guideline does not contain sufficient characters to describe (or discriminate between) all the Kales included within the above names.
- For Collards, the name var. *acephala* DC. should be replaced by var. *viridis* L.

WHAT THIS NOMENCLATURE INCLUDES

Although there are many different views on *Brassica* taxonomy, the following treatment is an acceptable one:

var. *palmifolia* DC. Jersey Kale Group

Includes a wide range of Tree Kales including 'Nerodi Toscana': Jersey Kale, Palm Cabbage, Italian Kale, Giant Jersey Kale, Jersey Kale, Chou de Jersey (Fr.), Palmkohl (Ger.), Cavolo palmizio (It.), Chou palmier (Fr.), Chou noir (Fr.), Chou noir de Toscane (Fr.), Italienischer Palmkohl (Ger.)

var. *sabellica* L. Borecole Group

Includes a wide range of kales including Curly Kale: Borecole; curly kale; dwarf Siberian kale; kitchen kale; Scotch kale; choud' aigrette (Fr.) Chou frise (Fr.) Chou lacinie (Fr.) Braunkohl (Ger.) Federkohl (Ger.) Grunkohl (Ger.) Krauskohl (Ger.) colcrepa (Sp.).

var. *viridis* L. Collards Group

Collards are non-heading Cabbage types which have a different leaf shape to the Borecole Group. They include some tree kales, but exclude Portuguese Kale (Tronchuda) var. *costata*. This group also includes types used for forage.

Collards; cow cabbage; spring cabbage; tall kale; chou cavalier (Fr.); chou commun (Fr.); Blatterskohl (Ger.); Blattkohl (Ger.); Futterkohl (Ger.); Kukohl (Ger.); barzacommun (Sp.)

There are 3 options for naming the guideline:

1. Expand the guideline to cover the wider range of Vegetable Kales in accordance with the nomenclature.

Effect: Would require the inclusion of a much wider range of material than was previously envisaged, an expansion of the character set, and subdivision the guideline into different types.

This option would be too complex for one guideline.

2. Limit the guideline to *Brassica oleracea* L var. *sabellica* L (Curly Kale) and *Brassica oleracea* L var. *palmifolia* DC. (Palm Tree Kale)

The current guideline does not provide sufficient characteristics to describe var. *palmifolia*. Currently it describes Curly Kale and includes 3 characteristics which are relevant to one *palmifolia* cultivar 'Nero di Toscana'. Accommodating just one cultivar of var. *palmifolia* is not a good basis for including var. *palmifolia* in the guideline.

Effect: This option would also require broadening the guideline (adding more characteristics) to describe other cultivars of var. *palmifolia*. As *palmifolia* material is clearly separable from Curly Kale, it could have a separate guideline if there was a demand, which is doubtful.

Currently there is little or no experience within the TWV of var. *palmifolia* cultivars.

3. Limit the guideline to *Brassica oleracea* L var. *sabellica* L. (Curly Kale) and remove characteristic 14 and state 5 for characteristics 7 and 8 which were included to describe specific varieties (cultivars) of Palm Tree Kales.

Effect: Guideline would be simpler and would accommodate all Curly Kales and Kales which have been crossed with Curly Kale e.g. 'Cottagers' and 'Pentland Brig'.

Would require little change to an almost completed guideline and could be agreed and implemented quickly. This is the recommended option.

[End of Annex II and of document]